

## WRITTEN REVIEW BY THE OFFICIAL REVIEWER

of the dissertation titled: "Scientifically Based Approaches to Organizing Nursing Care Aimed at Ensuring Quality of Life and Mental Health in Elderly and Senile Patients",  
submitted for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy (PhD)  
in the specialty 8D10104 – Nursing Science.

| No. | Criteria                                                                                                                                                                    | Compliance with Criteria (underline the appropriate response)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                       | Justification of the Official Reviewer's Position (comments should be italicized)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                   |
|-----|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| 1.  | The topic of the dissertation, (as of the date of its approval), corresponds to the current trends in scientific development and/or aligns with national research programs. | <p>1.1 Compliance with Priority Areas of Scientific Development or State Programs:</p> <p>1) The dissertation was carried out within the framework of a project or targeted program funded by the state budget (please specify the name and number of the project or program);</p> <p>2) The dissertation was completed as part of another state program (please specify the name of the program);</p> <p>3) The dissertation corresponds to a priority area of scientific development approved by the Higher Scientific and Technical Commission under the Government of the Republic of Kazakhstan (please specify the area).</p> | <p>The global population is aging rapidly, with the number of individuals aged 65 and over expected to double by 2050. This demographic shift presents complex challenges for healthcare systems, particularly in the area of geriatric care. As elderly patients often experience multiple chronic conditions, cognitive decline, and psychosocial stressors, traditional nursing approaches may be insufficient to meet their multifaceted needs. Therefore, there is an urgent necessity to develop and implement scientifically-based approaches to the organization of nursing care that address both the physical and mental well-being of older adults.</p> <p>This topic is of critical importance because evidence-based nursing practices are proven to improve clinical outcomes, enhance patient satisfaction, and optimize resource use. In the context of elderly care, scientifically grounded models can lead to more personalized and holistic care strategies, reducing the incidence of depression, anxiety, and social isolation, while promoting dignity, autonomy, and overall quality of life.</p> <p>Moreover, mental health is often underdiagnosed and undertreated in older adults due to stigma, lack of training, or the misattribution of symptoms to aging. Incorporating structured, evidence-based mental health support into routine nursing care can prevent deterioration and foster resilience among this vulnerable population. Addressing these needs through a well-organized, research-informed nursing framework not only aligns with ethical and professional standards but also supports public health goals and reduces long-term care costs.</p> <p>In conclusion, exploring and advancing scientifically-based organizational approaches to nursing care for elderly patients is</p> |

|    |                        |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                              |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                        |
|----|------------------------|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
|    |                        |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                              | essential for ensuring a high quality of life and mental well-being in old age. It contributes meaningfully to the modernization of geriatric care and to the development of health systems that are both compassionate and efficient. |
| 2. | Importance for Science | <p>The dissertation makes (or does not make) a substantial contribution to the advancement of scientific knowledge, and the significance of the research is well (or not adequately) substantiated.</p> <p>The study of scientifically-based approaches to organizing nursing care for the elderly is of substantial importance to the scientific community, particularly within the fields of nursing science, gerontology, psychology, and health systems research. As the global population ages, there is an increasing demand for innovative, evidence-based strategies that can effectively address the complex physical, emotional, and psychological needs of older adults.</p> <p>From a scientific standpoint, this topic advances the understanding of how structured nursing interventions—rooted in empirical research—can positively influence health outcomes, especially in terms of mental health and quality of life. It fosters interdisciplinary collaboration, integrating insights from medical science, behavioral health, and healthcare management to develop comprehensive care models tailored to aging populations.</p> <p>Furthermore, this research contributes to the standardization of best practices in geriatric nursing care, facilitating the development of clinical guidelines, decision-making frameworks, and training protocols that can be widely adopted. It also opens new avenues for scientific inquiry into age-related mental health disorders, caregiver-patient dynamics, and the impact of care environments on elderly well-being.</p> <p>By grounding nursing care in scientific principles, this research strengthens the evidence base needed for policy-making,</p> |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                        |

|    |                                   |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                        |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                      |
|----|-----------------------------------|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
|    |                                   |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                        | funding allocation, and healthcare reform, ultimately leading to more resilient and responsive healthcare systems. Thus, the topic not only addresses an urgent societal need but also propels scientific progress in the care of aging populations. |
| 3. | Principle of Independence         | Level of Research Independence:<br>1) High;<br>2) Moderate;<br>3) Low;<br>4) No independence demonstrated.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                             | High                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                 |
| 4. | Principle of Internal Consistency | <p>4.1 Justification of the Dissertation's Relevance:<br/>1) Well justified;<br/>2) Partially justified;<br/>3) Not justified.</p> <p>4.2 The Content of the Dissertation Reflects the Dissertation Topic:<br/>1) Fully reflects;<br/>2) Partially reflects;<br/>3) Does not reflect.</p> <p>4.3 The Aim and Objectives Correspond to the Dissertation Topic:<br/>1) Correspond;<br/>2) Partially correspond;<br/>3) Do not correspond.</p> <p>4.4 All Sections and Provisions of the Dissertation Are Logically Interconnected:<br/>1) Fully interconnected;<br/>2) Partially interconnected;<br/>3) Interconnection is absent.</p> <p>4.5 The New Solutions (Principles, Methods) Proposed by the Author Are Justified and Evaluated in Comparison with Existing Solutions:<br/>1) Critical analysis is present;<br/>2) Analysis is partial;<br/>3) The analysis consists of unsupported opinions and citations of other authors;<br/>4) The analysis is absent.</p> | <p>Well justified</p> <p>Fully reflects</p> <p>Correspond</p> <p>Fully interconnected</p> <p>Critical analysis is present</p>                                                                                                                        |

|    |                                       |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                     |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                    |
|----|---------------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| 5. | Principle of Scientific Novelty       | <p>5.1 Are the Scientific Results and Provisions New?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1) Completely new;</li> <li>2) Partially new (25-75% of the results are new);</li> <li>3) Not new (less than 25% of the results are new).</li> </ol> <p>5.2 Are the Conclusions of the Dissertation New?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Completely new;</li> <li>2. Partially new (25-75% of the conclusions are new);</li> <li>3. Not new (less than 25% of the conclusions are new).</li> </ol> <p>5.3 Are the Technical, Technological, Economic, or Managerial Solutions New and Justified?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1) Completely new;</li> <li>2) Partially new (25-75% of the solutions are new);</li> <li>3) Not new (less than 25% of the solutions are new).</li> </ol> | <p>New because evidence-based nursing practice is taking its first steps in the country. New also because it analyzes the role of the nurse - as an independent specialist, not as an assistant</p> <p>The conclusions are significant for the studied region. However, it would be desirable for the dissertation structure to have a section dedicated only to conclusions that would answer the tasks.</p> <p>This criterion does not apply to this dissertation.</p> <p>The conclusions are significant for the studied region. However, it would be desirable for the dissertation structure to have a section dedicated only to conclusions that would answer the tasks.</p> |
| 6. | Justification of the Main Conclusions | All the main conclusions are based / not based on substantial scientific evidence or are sufficiently well substantiated (for qualitative research and fields related to arts and humanities).                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                      | The conclusions are significant for the studied region. However, it would be desirable for the dissertation structure to have a section dedicated only to conclusions that would answer the tasks.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                 |
| 7. | Main Provisions to be Defended        | <p>The following questions must be answered for each provision individually:</p> <p>7.1 Has the Provision Been Proven?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1) Proven;</li> <li>2) Largely proven;</li> <li>3) Largely unproven;</li> <li>4) Not proven;</li> <li>5) It is impossible to assess the proof of the provision in its current formulation.</li> </ol> <p>7.2 Is the Provision Trivial?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1) Yes;</li> <li>2) No;</li> <li>3) It is impossible to assess the triviality of the provision in its current formulation.</li> </ol> <p>7.3 Is the Provision New?</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1) Yes;</li> <li>2) No;</li> <li>3) It is impossible to assess the novelty of the provision in its current formulation.</li> </ol>                | <p>Largely proven</p> <p>No</p> <p>Yes – new to the region</p>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                     |

[illegible]

|     |                                                                                                                                            |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                 |
|-----|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
|     | Practice?<br>1. Yes;<br>2. No.                                                                                                             | <p>increasing demands of an aging population, scientifically validated nursing strategies become essential for delivering safe, effective, and patient-centered care.</p> <p>From a clinical perspective, this research supports the development of structured care pathways that integrate physical health monitoring with proactive mental health interventions. It enables nurses to move beyond task-based care toward holistic, personalized care models that improve patient outcomes—such as reduced hospital readmissions, better medication adherence, lower incidence of depression, and enhanced quality of life.</p> <p>In practice, such research informs the creation of training programs, clinical protocols, and assessment tools that help healthcare professionals identify early signs of psychological distress, cognitive decline, or functional deterioration in older adults. It also supports the implementation of multidisciplinary team approaches, which have been shown to be more effective in managing complex geriatric cases. Moreover, by generating data on what works and why, this research equips healthcare leaders and policymakers with the scientific evidence needed to allocate resources more effectively, improve nursing workflows, and ensure ethical, cost-efficient elder care. Ultimately, it bridges the gap between theory and practice, promoting continuous improvement in geriatric nursing care across diverse clinical settings.</p> |
|     | 9.3 Are the Proposals for Practice New?<br>1) Completely new;<br>2) Partially new (25-75% are new);<br>3) Not new (less than 25% are new). | New                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                             |
| 10. | Quality of Writing and Formatting<br><br>Quality of Academic Writing:<br>1. High;<br>2. Average;<br>3. Below average;<br>4. Low.           | Average                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         |

|     |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                |
|-----|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| 11. | Comments on the Dissertation                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                            | Both palliative care and elderly care and quality of care are new areas for the region. Also, evidence-based nursing practice is only just beginning to develop and its concept is not clear to everyone. In addition, changes in the nursing profession in the country require a new approach and research into nurse autonomy. Therefore, the dissertation work is timely and important with its results and recommendations |
| 12. | Scientific Quality of the Doctoral Candidate's Articles on the Research Topic<br>(In the case of a dissertation defense in the form of a series of articles, the official reviewers are to comment on the scientific quality of each article related to the research topic.)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                            | NA                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                             |
| 13. | Decision of the Official Reviewer:<br>1) Award the degree of Doctor of Philosophy (PhD);<br>2) Send the dissertation for revision if it does not meet the established requirements and/or partially complies with the principles (except for the principle of academic integrity), and/or if there are comments that need to be addressed. In the case of a dissertation defense in the form of a series of articles, the dissertation is not sent for revision;<br>3) Deny the award of the Doctor of Philosophy (PhD) degree in cases of violation of | <b>Award the degree of Doctor of Philosophy (PhD)</b>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                          |

|  |                                                                                                                                         |  |
|--|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|--|
|  | the principle of academic integrity or non-compliance with the principles of scientific novelty, internal consistency, and reliability. |  |
|--|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|--|

Official Reviewer:

**Blaževičienė Aurelija** – PhD, Professor, Head of the Department of Nursing at the Lithuanian University of Health Sciences, Director of the WHO Collaborating Centre for Education and Practice in Nursing (Kaunas, Lithuania).

